A Case Study of "Introduction to Quran by Montgomery Watt"

Dr. Hafiz Mohsen Zia Qazi

Assistant Professor Department of Islamic Studies, MY University, Islamabad hod.islamicstudies@myu.edu.pk

Dr. Saeed Ahmad

Lecturer Department of Islamic studies Hitec University Taxila

Dr. Rafi Ullah

lecturer Department of Islamic studies Hitec University Taxila

Dr. Ahmad Hassan Khattak

Assistant professor Department of Islamic studies Hitec University Taxila Corresponding email- rafiullah.qureshi@hitecuni.edu.pk

Abstract

This study is an attempt to examine the objections of the orientalists especially the "Montgomery Watt" in his book "Introduction to the Qur'an". Qur'an is a Holy Book not only for the Muslims but to guide all human beings. A lot of work has done on different dimensions of the Qur'an by Muslims and non-Muslim scholars but Watt has raised objections in the verses of the Holy Qur'an that they are not inter-connected. He has raised his argument in the light of different concepts of collection and compilation of the Qur'an. This attempt mainly concerns to find out the real processes behind the compilation and the actual meanings of collection of the Qur'an. Objections regarding Qur'an and Prophet (PBUH) have been mentioned made by different orientalists. The efforts of different scholars have been mentioned who treated this topic. This study includes the explanation of those verses on which Watt objected that they are not connected with the former verses. Although the relevant discussions have not been expanded largely some closely related aspects have also been addressed to reach at possible conclusion as well as with the hope that this thesis may provide further direction for the future.

Key words: Qur'an, Montgomery Watt, Orientalists, Compilation, Introduction

1. Introduction:

Allah SWT sent Adam from heaven to earth, He on the very same time sent a complete system of guidance's to all of human beings. The Holy Scriptures and their respective prophets were important part of this system. The holy Qur'an and the Prophet (PBUH) were last and the final episode of this series. It was also the part of Divine planning that the last holy book would be comprises of all the basic teachings of the old scriptures and on the very same time it should be self-sufficient for all of the human beings till the day of resurrection. So the Qur'an was not only being read and understood by the Muslims by faith but it is the scholars of different faiths who show their keen interest to Qur'an.

2.1 Objection on the literary style of the Qur'an:

William Montgomery Watt was born in 14 March 1909 at Scotland and died in 24th October 2006.He was a Scottish historian, Orientalist, Anglican priest, and academic. His

father was a minister of the church of Scotland. W. Montgomery Watt, who in his long lifetime was probably the foremost non-Muslim interpreter of Islam in the West, was an enormously influential scholar in the field of Islamic studies and a much-revered name for many Muslims all over the world.

Watt work as Assistant Lecturer in Moral Philosophy, Edinburgh University 1934-38, Lecturer in Ancient Philosophy 1946-47, Lecturer, then Senior Lecturer and Reader in Arabic 1947-64, Professor of Arabic and Islamic Studies 1964-79 (Emeritus); ordained deacon 1939, priest 1940; Curate, St Mary, Bolton's, London 1939-41; Curate, Old St Paul's, Edinburgh 1941-43; Arabic specialist to Bishop of Jerusalem 1943-46; Chairman, Association of British Orientalists 1964-65he spent nearly all his long and fruitful career. He was awarded a personal chair in 1964 and he retired in 1979.

Soon after he returned to Scotland, he was appointed Lecturer in Arabic at Edinburgh in 1946; there he wrote thirty books but his major works are; The faith and practices of al-Ghazali, Muhammad at Mecca, Muhammad at Medina, Muhammad: Prophet (PBUH) and Statesman, Islam: A short History etc. Watt has been called the last orientalist.

Watt was awarded many academic honor's; he held visiting professorships at the University of Toronto, the College de France, and Georgetown University, and received the American Giorgio Levi Della Vida Medal and was, as its first recipient, the British Society for Middle Eastern Studies award for outstanding scholarship.

The understudy book Introduction to Qur'an was originally written by Richard Bell who was a British Arabism at the University of Edinburgh. Between 1937 and 1939 he published a translation of the Qur'an, and in 1953 his Introduction to the Qur'an was published and revised in 1970 by Watt. The book comprises of eleven chapters, Chapter first is "The Historical context "second is "Muhammad's Prophetic Experience "Third is "The history of the Text "and in this very chapter Bell has raised objections regarding the authenticity of Qur'anic text.

Many orientalists describe the sacred book as having "many literary defects, obscure sentences and strain words, numerous contradictions and filled with faults of grammar and style which it would have been so easy to rectify, a wearisome jumble, crude and incondite, its very words were inherently and perniciously defective". Some orientalists also criticized the Qur'anic rhymes concluded that the verses were "wrongly assembled, interrupted or detached". They also asserted that the Qur'anic style was mechanically repetitions of limited lexical range, filled with clumsy grammar, unforgivable pleonasm and the style decoration in many parts and with contraction and hysteron porter on in many others opinions.

These objections relate to the present arrangement of the book. Quran not an authored book like other books, it is not comprising on chapters. If we thorough study the Qur'an there will be no possibility of such like objections. It is not only the Qur'an but in the past it was a trend that famous authors used to mention the new things with little relevance.

Jahir was a prominent writer of Arabic literature, in his book "Al Bayan- WA- Tibyan" he frequently includes a new instance, short story or a fiction with minor relevance and he use this sentence يذكر to switch over. So it is not right to say that there is no coherence in some verses of the Qur'an. Though it is said that Qur'an is not according to the literary style of the present day books. Quran's a universal book it is not justifying that anybody could make objections to its literary style comparing or confining it to any particular writings. It is also a refutable fact that all of the verses are completely coherent and their arrangement is quite logical.

2.2 Disconnected Verses:

About the collection of the Qur'an Bell created his argument that happening in the center of a surah or of a paragraph entirely dissimilar to the perspective was to strength the view that this passage has been written on the back of the 'scrap of paper' used for one of the adjacent which appropriately belonged to the surah. Bell chosen the following passages.¹

S. No.	Name of Surah	Surah Number	Verse Number
1.	Al-Baqarah	02	20-22
2.	Al-Baqarah	02	186
3.	Al-Baqarah	02	285-286
4.	An-Nisa	04	88
5.	Al-Anam	06	141-144
6.	Al –Araaf	07	57-58
7.	At-Tawba	09	40
8.	At-Tawba	09	127-128
9.	Al-Hajj	22	5-8
10.	Al-Zumar	39	75
11.	Al-Mudathir	74	31
12.	Al-Qeyyama	75	16-19
13.	An-Naba	78	33-34
14.	Abasa	80	34-37
15.	Al-Inshikak	84	16-19
16.	Al-Aala	87	16-19
17.	Al-Ghashiya	88	6-7
18.	Al-Ghashiya	88	17-20

According to Bell and Watt the following verses do not have any coherence;

2.3 Al Baqarah; (20-22)

¹W.Montgomary Watt.*Introduction to the Quran*.(Edinburgh:Edinburgh university Press,1970) ,101.

Al-Qantara, Volume, 8, Issue 2, 2022

] يَكَادُ الْبَرْقُ يَخْطَفُ أَبْصَارَ هُمْ كُلَّمَا أَضَاءَ لَهُمْ مَشَوْا فِيهِ وَإِذَا أَظْلَمَ عَلَيْهِمْ قَامُوا وَلَوْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ لَذَهَبَ بِسَمْعِهِمْ وَأَبْصَارِ هِمْ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلَى كُلِّ شَيْءٍ قَدِيرٌ ٥يَاأَيُّهَا النَّاسُ اعْبُدُوا رَبَّكُمُ الَّذِي خَلَقَكُمْ وَالَّذِينَ مِنْ قَبْلِكُمْ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَتَّقُونَ الَّذِي جَعَلَ لَكُمُ الْأَرْضَ فِرَاشًا وَالسَّمَاءَ بِنَاءً وَأَنْزَلَ مِنَ السَّمَاءِ مَاءً فَأَخْرَجَ بِهِ مِنَ النَّمَرَاتِ رِزْقًا لَكُمْ فَلَا تَجْعَلُوا لِيَّهِ أَنْدَادًا وَأَنْتُمَ عَالَهُ مَا مُ

[The lightning almost snatched away their sight from them. As often as it flashed forth for them they walk therein, and when it darkened against them they stand still. If Allah willed, He could destroy their hearing and their sight. Lo! Allah is able to do all things. (20) O mankind! worship your Lord, who hath created you and those before you, so that ye may ward off (evil). (21) Who hath appointed the earth a resting-place for you and the sky a canopy; and caused water to pour down from the sky, thereby producing fruits as food for you. And do not set up rivals to Allah when ye know (better). (22)]

Objection:

According to Watt the above mentioned verses are out of context. According to Watt verse 17-18 closes the passage but verse 19 till 22 added later on because they do not have any link to their background.

Answer;

Two examples are mentioned in these verses. Majority of the scholars have the opinion that verse 8-20 is about hypocrites. The Qur'an mentioned almost all of the secrets of the hypocrite's.²While Amin Ahsan Eslai have the opinion that these verse were about Jews.³ As Qur'an is revealed on the literary style of the Arabs rational and intellectual and veiled themes were defined through specific examples so that it would be easy to understand.

Through these two examples the intellectual, mental and extremal life of hypocrites has been narrated. When they embraced the Islam their intellectual abilities were as Enlighted as fire brightened the environment. But they started doubting about the guidance of Qur'an, as a result they lost their enlightenment and the shadows of disbelieve spread everywhere.⁴

In the next example the evolution of their stray has been mentioned that during their hypocrisy they follow the righteous path for very short span of time then again they

²AbuAlaala Maududi.*Tafheem-ul-Quran*.(vol 1.Lahore:Army Education Publication House,1946),52-53.

³Amin Ahsan Islahi. *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 1. (Lahore: Faran Foundation, 1985), 131-133.

⁴Hussain Ali.translated by Mehmood Hassan Deuobandi.*Tafseer Jawahirul Quran*.with alterations and editions by Ghulam Ullah Khan.vol 1.(Rawalpindi:Kutab Khana Rasheedia),24-26.

retreated. The preaching and prosperity of Islam bought them as destructive element which brings them to the hang of death. In both examples the interior condition of the hypocrites have been mentioned from which the travelers of Arab caravan were familiar with.⁵So these verses are coherent with its context.

According to Amin Ahsan Eslahi the verses from 8-20 are describing the hypocrites while the verses from 20-22 illustrate the state of affairs and circumstances of Jews. According to him the first example is about Hazrat Moosa prophet hood that Moosa brought towards the light of knowledge. But due to their constant misdeeds (the details of their misdeed are mentioned in the Holy Testament and Bible) all of the people get astray from right path as if they were deaf and dumb.⁶

The second example is about the revelation of Qur'an. It has glad tidings for the believers and at the same time warnings and cautions for the disbelievers. The disbelievers pretended to be deaf and dumb when they exposed to the warning against them and by doing so the felt themselves safe and sound.⁷

According to Islahi these instances are about the two groups of Jews. The reason for the opposition of first group was the stagnation and obstipation and the reason for the opposition of the second group was jealousy and foresightedness. Through these commentaries we come to know that the objection of Bell and Watt is not right that these verses are out of context.

Oh People worship me...., this verse refers towards the disbelievers of the Arabs. The disbelievers believe that Allah Almighty is the creator but on the very same time they give some attribute of Allah to their ancestors.⁸In this verse Allah ordered His worship and also tells five ways or signs to recognize Him, two signs are from within us and the three are from the universe. First one is to ponder upon yourself that He created you from nothing

⁵ Muhammad Idrees Qandalvi.*Ma'ariful Quran*,(Sindh:Maktaba Al Marif,1422) 97.

⁶ Islahi.*Tadubural Quran*.Vol 1.,137.

⁷Ghulam Rasool Saeedi.*Tibyanul Quran* .(Lahore: Fareed Bool Stall,2005) Vol 1,314-317.

⁸ Islahi. *Tadubural Quran*. (. Lahore: Faran Foundation, 1985), Vol 1. 137.

and second sign is that He created your ancestors. Third one He spread the land as a cushion, fourth one sky as ceiling and fifth one that He created food for you from sky and earth. So you should worship Him.⁹

Al Baqarah: (186)

]وَإِذَا سَأَلَكَ عِبَادِي عَنِّي فَإِنِّي قَرِيبٌ أُجِيبُ دَعْوَةَ الدَّاعِ إِذَا دَعَانِ فَلْيَسْتَجِيبُوا لِي وَلْيُؤْمِنُوا بِي لَعَلَّهُمْ يَرْشُدُونَ [

[And when My servants question thee concerning Me, then surely I am nigh. I answer the prayer of zthe suppliant when he cried unto Me. So let them hear My call and let them trust in Me, in order that they may be led aright.186]

Objection:

There is the proof of change and amendment in the Qur'an from subject matter and the situation. According to Watt verse 186 is totally unrelated to its background because it does not have any reference to fasting. After verse 186 there is dramatic change and verse 187 proceeds to the topic of fasting. The length of verse 185 is quite different from the length of verse 186 this shows that the space on the back of verse 184 was utilized which was discussing some other context.

Answer;

In Verse 183-185 injunctions and virtues relating to fasting and Ramadan were mentioned. In between, this brief verse has been introduced to convince of Allah to obey the orders of Allah by recognizing how He, in His unique grace, hears and answers their prayers.¹⁰There is no disbelief about fasting being a hard duty despite many concessions and permissions.

Muhammad Taqi-ud-din Al-Hilali, and Muhammad Moshin Khan. *Tafseer-i-Maeani Al Quran-ul-Kareem*. (Riyaad: Maktaba Dar-ul-Islam, 1996), 14-15.

Jalaludin Sayuti and Jalaludin Mahhili. *Tafseer Kamaleen*. (Urdu Translation of Tafseer Jalallin. Translated by Muhammad Naeem Deobandi. Karachi: Dar-i-Ishat, 2008).

Abdul Majid Daryabadi. *Tafsir-ul-Quran*. (vol 1. Karachi: Darul Ishaat, 1991), 15-16.

¹⁰ Hussain Ali.*Tafseer Jawahirul Quran.91*

⁹Qandalvi.*Ma'arufal Quran*.(Sindh:Maktabah Al Marif,1422),97.

For more detail of the same verse also see :

Muhammad Ahmad Raza khan Brelvi Qaadri. *The Holy Quran*. Translation of Kinzul Eman. (Lahore: Awais Company), 20.

Abur Rehman Kilani. *Taseer-ul-Quran*. (Lahore: Maktabatul Islam, 1426) vol- 1, 50-51.

Muhammad Aslam Saddiqi. Tafseer Ruhul Quran. (Lahore: Maktaba idara Mariful Islami, 2010), 181-185.

Al-Qantara, Volume, 8, Issue 2, 2022

It is to make the test tolerable that special grace has been mentioned¹¹In general the scholars has mentioned the coherence of this verse that verse 185 ends in these words أَطَلَىٰ مَا هَدَنكُمْ وَلَعَلَّصُمْ تَسْتَكُرُونَ these words created a feelings of gratitude. So they started saying prayers loudly than this verse was revealed that it is not necessary to loudly call your prayer and supplications because Allah is so near to His servants. The same theme has been mentioned in the surah Quaff verse 16

So this verse is completely connected from the previous verse.¹² . وَنَحْنُ أَقْرَبُ إِلَيْهِ مِنْ حَبّل ِٱلْوَرِيد

Amin Ahsan Islahi narrated the coherence in a different way according to him this verse was a initiate to those questions which were being formed in the minds of people after the obligation of fasting regarding to its injections and virtues. The verse was inculcating the aptitude among the people that whatever questions were arising in their mind they should ask them without any hesitation, Allah will surly answer those questions especially to that period of time in which the revelation was being revealed.¹³The above mentioned detail shows that these verses are no disjoint.

Al Baqarah: (285-286)

] آمَنَ الرَّسُولُ بِمَا أُنْزِلَ إلَيْهِ مِنْ رَبِّهِ وَالْمُؤْمِنُونَ كُلُّ آمَنَ بِاللَّهِ وَمَلَائِكَتِهِ وَكُتُبِهِ وَرُسُلِهِ لَا نُفَرَقُ بَيْنَ أَحَدٍ مِنْ رُسُلِهِ وَقَالُوا سَمِعْنَا وَأَطَعْنَا غُفْرَانَكَ رَبَّنَا وَإِلَيْكَ الْمُصِيرُ (285) لَا يُكَلِّفُ اللَّهُ نَفْسًا إلَّا وُسْعَهَا لَهَا مَا كَسَبَتُ وَعَلَيْهَا مَا اكْتَسَبَتْ رَبَّنَا لَا تُوَاخِذْنَا إِنْ نَسِينَا أَوْ أَخْطَأْنَا رَبَّنَا وَلا تَحْمِلْ عَلَيْنَا إِصْرًا كَمَا حَمَلْتَهُ عَلَى الَّذِينَ مِنْ قَبْلِنَا وَ لَا يُكَلِّفُ اللَّهُ وَعَالَيْكَ وَاعْذَا إِنْ نَسِينَا أَوْ أَخْطَأْنَا رَبَّنَا وَلا تَحْمِلْ عَلَيْنَا إِصْرًا كَمَا حَمَلْتَهُ عَلَى الَّذِين

[The messenger believeth in that which hath been revealed unto him from his Lord and (so do) believers. Each one believeth in Allah and His angels and His scriptures and His messengers - We make no distinction between any of His messengers - and they say: We hear, and we obey. (Grant us) Thy forgiveness, our Lord. Unto Thee is the journeying. (285) Allah tasked not a soul beyond its scope. For it (is only) that which it hath earned, and against it (only) that which it hath deserved. Our Lord! Condemn us not if we forget, or miss the mark! Our Lord! Lay not on us such a burden as thou didst lay on those before us! Our Lord! Impose not on us that which we have not the strength to bear! Pardon us, absolve us and have mercy on us, Thou, our Protector, and give us victory over the disbelieving folk. (286)]

Objection:

Verse 285 has no link with 286 or with the perspective. As verses 282-283 talking about the maintains of record of debts. And verses 285- 286 are talking about the occupation of the believers. Watt assume that the verse about debts have been written on the back of a

¹¹Islahi. *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 1,452-455.

 ¹²Al Maraghi, Ahmad MustufaAl Maraghi. *Tafseer Al Maraghi*. (Dar ul Fikr:Behrut, 2001) vol 1.168-169.
¹³Islahi. *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 1, 453-455

paper in which the verse about usury was written the sheet was later cut into two pieces and this how the two irrelevant leftovers emerge on the other side of the page.

Answer:

According to Bell and Watt the verses 285-286 are disjoined from the former verse because the former verses deals with the recording of debts and interest and the following verse is about dua or supplication. While protesting about these verses Bell and Watt forget about this thing that theses verses are closing the surah. It is a set principle of a speech and writing that at the end such message is try to give which conclude whole of the writing or speech.

These three verses belong to such a principle. If we pounder upon whole of the Surah we come to know that there are two important topics discussed in detail. After the introduction of Surah from verse 39-121 Jews were addressed.¹⁴ They were invited to have faith on the last Prophet (PBUH). It was told to them that the glad tidings of last Prophet (PBUH) were mentioned in their testaments and a promise was taken to them that they will always support the Prophet (PBUH)'s mission in return of this favor their status will be as it was. But instead of fulfilling their promise they started rebellions against the Prophet (PBUH). All of their intellectual and moral weakness that stop them to have faith in Prophet (PBUH) were discussed in detail. It is said that the Jews use to recognize the Prophet (PBUH) as any person recognized his own son but knowing all about Prophet (PBUH) they break their promise. And due to breaking their promise they were dismissed from the rank of Imamate¹⁵.

Verse 122-162 talk about Prophet Ibrahim, his construction of Holy Kaaba and his pray, as the result of his pray the rank of Imamate was given to the children of his second son Ismael (AS).¹⁶

After this the basic principles of Islamic sharia were mentioned in detail from verse 163-242 in which the Jews and disbelievers inserted some distortions. These principles are as following:

- 1. Oneness of Allah Almighty; 163-176.¹⁷
- 2. Prayer and Zakat; 177.¹⁸
- 3. Qisas(Law of equality) and Diya (Penal Code); 178-179.¹⁹

¹⁴Islahi.*Tadubural Quran*.Vol 1,648-652.

¹⁵ Maududi.Tafheem ul Qur'ān.vol 1,223-225.

¹⁶ Hussain Ali.Tafseer Jawahirul Qur'ān,138.

¹⁷Kilani, Abur Rehman. *Taseer-ul-QUR'AN*. (vol 1. Lahore: Maktabatul Islām), 124-130.

¹⁸ Al Maraghi, Ahmad Mustafa. *Tafseer Al Maraghi*. Dar-al-kotob Al Ilmiyah: Lebanon, 2006.

¹⁹Yousaf,Hafiz Salahudin.*Tafseer Ahsanul Beyan*.Translated by Mulana Muhammad Juna Ghari.edited by Mulana

- 4. Bequest;180-182.²⁰
- 5. Fasting;183-187.²¹
- 6. Prohibition of stealing, deceiving and bribery; 188.²²
- 7. Pilgrimage, Holy wars and Charity; 189-218.²³
- 8. Prohibition of Alcoholic drink, gambling, Maintain the Orphan's rights and prohibition of marrying disbelievers men/women; 219-221.²⁴
- 9. Family Laws; 222-242.²⁵
- 10. The conditions of Charity and the prohibition orbit(interest); 243-283.²⁶

The whole surah is telling about the Jews that due to their misdeeds and because of breaking of their promise they were dismissed from the rank of imamate and this honor was further given to the Muslim Ummah. Most of the people from Muslim Ummah had the background from pre- Islamic ignorance, those Muslims were worried about their pre-Islamic thinking's and habits and they were afraid of being punished as the Jews were punished. So it was necessary that at the end of the surah the doubts and fears in the minds of new Muslims should be addressed and they should be guided to maintain their rank of imamate.²⁷

In the above mentioned three versus the same necessity was fulfil. It was told that this universe belongs to Allah Almighty and no tribe, nation and race on the bases of its nation or race can hold the rank of imamate. This honor is for those people who obey the orders of Allah and have faith on all of the Prophets.²⁸

A thought arises in the mind of man that a person can never achieve a position through his hard work and efforts which is mentioned in the book of Allah and shown by life of Prophets. So a hope and encouragement is given in these verses that Allah does not burden a person beyond his capacity. Although whatever the burden is given he is answerable for his deeds, he is rewarded for his good deeds and punished for bad deeds.

Safi ur Raḥmān Mubarik Puri,Dar ul Salām:Lahore,1995. 94

²⁰Qandalvi.*Ma'arufal Qur'ān*.vol 1. 384-385.

²¹ Maududi.*Tafheem ul Qur `ān* .Vol 1.141-147.

²² Ali.*Tafseer Jawahirul Qur*'ān .Vol 1.92-93.

²³Mufti Muhammad Shāfi. *M,ariful Qur `ān*.(Idara al Maharif:Karachi,2001),464-538.

²⁴Saeedi, Ghulam Rasool. *Tibyanul QUR* ⁷*AN*. (Vol 1. Lahore: Fareed Bool Stall, 2005), 810-861.

²⁵Usmani,Shabeer Ahmad.*Tafseer-i- Usmani*.Translated by Mulana Mehmood ul Hassan. (Maktaba Rehmania:Lahore),137-148.

²⁶ Muhammad bin Hussain bin Masʿūd Al Fira al Baghvi Ashsahfi. *Tafseer-i- Baghvi*. Research and Eddition

by Khalid Abdul Rahmān.Marwan Idara Talifat Ashrafia:Multan,2009.225-270.

²⁷Isalhi, *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 1, 78-79.

²⁸ Maududi. *Tafheem ul Qur `ān*.vol 1,225.

Instead of trying his best to err is human he may commit different mistakes so the ends with a pray that if any mistake take place we should apologize or repent He is our lord He will forgive us. It is very necessary to apologize because with the regret of being sinful a person can be victim to different kind of complexes and with such like complexes his performance may effect.

So we come to know that above three verses are not directly related to financial matters but this is the conclusion of the surah which is on the standard pattern of speech and writing.²⁹

2.4 An-Nisa:88

] فَمَا لَكُمْ فِي الْمُنَافِقِينَ فِنَتَيْنِ وَاللَّهُ أَرْكَسَهُمْ بِمَا كَسَبُوا أَثَرِ يدُونَ أَنْ تَهْدُوا مَنْ أَضَلَّ اللَّهُ وَمَنْ يُضْلِلِ اللَّهُ فَلَنْ تَجِدَ لَهُ سَبِيلًا [

[What ailed you that ye are become two parties regarding the hypocrites, when Allah cast them back (to disbelief) because of what they earned? Seek ye to guide him whom Allah hath sent astray? He whom Allah sanded astray, for him thou (O Muhammad) canst not find a road. (88)]

Objection:

In surah 4 the verses 88-91 have been written on the back of verse 79,81 and 87.Verse 82 breaks the correlation among the verse 81 and 83.According to Watt verses 79-84 are certainly private and did not mean to recite publicly. These sort of verses are proposed only for Muhammad himself but they are incorporated in the Qur'an.

Answer:

It is said that verse 79-84 was a private wahi toward Prophet (PBUH) which was later inserted to Qur'an. In Qur'an so many verses are divided in such a manner that in a verse one portion has some guidance for Prophet (PBUH) and the other portion has some instructions for the people. This hypothesis is only formed after neglecting the relationship between Prophet (PBUH) and the people. If this hypothesis is thought to be true, it devastates whole of Qur'an. It is repeatedly mentioned in Qur'an that Allah SWT has nominated many people for the guidance of human beings, Allah SWT trained these nominated people on the very same time. This training has special aspects for the public for example;

To guide people about cleanliness and purity, it was said to Prophet (PBUH)

]وَثِيَابَكَ فَطَهِّرْ ٥ وَٱلرُّجْزَفَٱهُجُرْ [

[(3) Thy raiment purify, (4) Pollution shun!³⁰]

²⁹ Al Maraghi ,vol 1.208-210.

³⁰ Al Qur'ān. Chapter 74. Al Muddaththir ;verses 3-4.

To prepare the public for night prayers first it was Prophet (PBUH) who was asked to stand for prayer in the night.

[تَنِصِفَهُ أَوِ ٱنقُصْ مِنْهُ قَلِيلاه نَقُمُ ٱلَّيْلَ إِلَّاقَلِيلاه تَيَأَيُّهُ الْمُزَمِّل]

[O thou wrapped up in thy raiment! (1) Keep vigil the night long, save a little - (2) A half thereof, or abate a little thereof (3)]³¹

The Prophet (PBUH) is a role model for people so the stages of training could not be private so that all of the readers of Qur'an can understand that the person who is think to be their role model how he go through from the process of training.³²

To prepare the leadership for the future is a big concern of society so there was a need that a person who send as the role model for humanity; his process of training and sequence should be kept in record because a syllabus was also maintaining for the future leadership. And the preparation of syllabus for the future leadership was not at all belongs to private life rather it was a public matter.³³

This hypothesis is also wrong on the grounds that Prophet (PBUH) only focus to write Holy Qur'an and prepare its copies. Private wahi was never been written, for example Qur'an is talking repeatedly about the offering of prayers but its timing, its contents etc. are not mentioned in the Qur'an, Prophet (PBUH) never preserve them in writing but practically applied that in the society. So it is absolutely wrong to say that these verses were private wahi towards the Prophet (PBUH).³⁴Although Prophet (PBUH) were individually addressed in these verses but there is a special reason behind this, a big majority of hypocrites were living in Madina they use to urge Prophet (PBUH) to take part in Holy wars, but when Prophet (PBUH) ordered them to fight they show their reluctance and start criticizing the Islam's war policy. Then criticize also influence some of the Muslims, so there was a need to tell them that Prophet (PBUH) is there to be followed and Allah's obedience is accomplished through Prophet (PBUH)'s obedience. If Prophet (PBUH) ordered to take part in a war or stop to do that it was under the guidance of Allah SWT.³⁵

When some people were requesting Prophet (PBUH) for war and some were showing their reluctance in this situation Allah SWT told Prophet (PBUH) that his responsibility is to take part in the war and to inform people. So these verses are not private these verses are the syllabus of Prophet (PBUH)'s training and disclosing the secrets of hypocrites.

The word of اإلَّا قليلا is not breaking the connection but it is telling that the number of those people is very limited who take influence from the conspiracies of the hypocrites. There

³¹ Al Qur'ān .Chapter 73.1-3.

³²Isalhi, *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 1.652.

³³ Maududi.*Tafheem ul Qur `ān*.vol 1,379.

³⁴ Ali.*Tafseer Jawahirul Qur `ān* .Vol 1,233.

³⁵Isalhi, *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 2,358-359.

Al-Qantara, Volume, 8, Issue 2, 2022

الْقَوْمَ الظَّالِمِينَ [

were many groups who settled in Madina among them one was Muhajireen, who sacrificed everything for Islamite second group was of Ansar in which Oss and Khizraj were two main tribes, there were Muslim and hypocrites among them. It was very sure that Muhajireen were not trapped in the conspiracies of Hypocrites.³⁶ There was a doubt that these Ansar because of their close relations get trapped in the conspiracies of the hypocrites. During this situation it was necessary to inform them that they should follow the footsteps of Muhajireen. By using this phrase (أَلَا قَالِاً قَالَا اللَّهُ عَلَياتُ those people are praised who were not influenced through the conspiracies of hypocrites and secondly they were trained that their role model would be the Muhajireen in every obscurity.

2.5 Al-Anaam: (141-144)

]وَهُوَ الَّذِي أَنْشَأَ جَنَّاتٍ مَعْرُوشَاتٍ وَعَيْرَ مَعْرُوشَاتٍ وَالنَّخْلَ وَالزَّرْعَ مُخْتَلِفًا أَكْلُهُ وَالزَّيْتُونَ وَالرُّمَّانَ مُتَشَابِهًا وَ عَيْرَ مُتَشَابِهِ كُلُوا مِنْ ثَمَرِهِ إِذَا أَثْمَرَ وَآتُوا حَقَّهُ يَوْمَ حَصَادِهِ وَلَا تُسْرِفُوا إِنَّهُ لَا يُحِبُّ الْمُسْرِفِينَ (141) وَمِنَ الْأَنْعَامِ حَمُولَةً وَفَرْشَاً كُلُوا مِمَّا رَزَقَكُمُ اللَّهُ وَلَا تَتَبِعُوا خُطُوَاتِ الشَّيْطَانِ إِنَّهُ لَكُمْ عَدُقٌ مُبِينُ تَمَانِيَةَ أَزْوَاجٍ مِنَ الضَّأْنِ انْتَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ اتْتَبِعُوا خُطُوَاتِ الشَّيْطَانِ إِنَّهُ لَكُمْ عَدُقٌ مُبِينُ (142) يَولُمُ النَّذَيْنِ أَمُ اللَّذَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ اتْتَيْنِ قُلْ النَّكَرَيْنِ حَرَّمَ أَمِ الْأُنْثَيْنِ أَمَا بِعِلْمِ إِنْ كُنْتُمُ صَادِقِينَ (143) وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ اتْنَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ الْنَيْنِ فَلْ الْنَيْنَيْن الْأَنْتَيْنِنَ أَمْ كُنْتُمُ صَادِقِينَ (143) وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ الْنَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْمَعْذِي الْنَقَيْنِ عَلَيْهِ أَنْ

[He it is Who produced gardens trellised and untrellised, and the date-palm, and crops of diver's flavor, and the olive and the pomegranate, like and unlike. Eat ye of the fruit thereof when it fruited, and pay the due thereof upon the harvest day, and be not prodigal. Lo! Allah love not the prodigals. (141) And of the cattle (He produced) some for burdens, some for food. Eat of that which Allah hath bestowed upon you, and follow not the footsteps of the devil, for lo! he is an open foe to you. (142) Eight pairs: Of the sheep twain, and of the goat's twain. Say: Hath He forbidden the two males or the two females, or that which the wombs of the two females contain? Expound to me (the case) with knowledge, if ye are truthful. (143) And of the camel's twain and of the oxen twain. Say: Hath He forbidden the two males or the two females contain; or were ye by to witness when Allah commanded you (all) this? Then who doth greater wrong than he who devised a lie concerning Allah, that he may lead mankind astray without knowledge. Lo! Allah guides not wrongdoing folk. (144)]

Another way in which passages have been adapted is illustrated by 6.141/2-144/5. These verses are grammatically discoherent, according to Watt each verse may be divided into two further parts. The initial portions by themselves give a record of God's blessings in the

³⁶Jalaludin Sayuti and Jalaludin Mahhili. *Tafseer Kamaleen*. (Urdu Translation of Tafseer Jalallin. Translated by Muhammad Naeem Deobandi. Karachi: Dar-i-Ishat, 2008), 68-69.

form of the soil and animals; the second portion has been introduced resentment for pagan food-taboos.

Answer:

It is said that verse 141-144 of surah Al-Annam do not have the relevance to its context and according to grammar each of them should be divided into two parts. This objection does not have any academic base because this is a well-known fact that the development of languages is not dependent to its grammar rather grammar of any language developed according the language. That is why there is no hundred percent perfect rule regarding grammar. There are certain exceptions regarding grammar because it is developed on the grounds that how people use to talk and write, it is not so that first the rules of grammar have been designed and people will directed to write and speak according to that.³⁷If there would be any contradiction of grammar used in the Arab society; It was firstly objected by the Arab people themselves that the language of Qur'an is not standardized. Basically grammar is usually designed for the foreigner so that they can better understand a language and can avoid errors. It is not right to make objection on the grammar of native people.

2.6 Al Araf: (57-58)

[And He it is Who sended the winds as tidings heralding His mercy, till, when they bear a cloud heavy (with rain), We lead it to a dead land, and then cause water to descend thereon and thereby bring forth fruits of every kind. Thus bring We forth the dead. Haply ye may remember. (57) As for the good land, its vegetation cometh forth by permission of its Lord; while as for that which is bad, only the evil cometh forth (from it). Thus do We recount the tokens for people who give thanks. (58)]

Objection:

In the verses 57 and 58 the sign of God's kindness in the resumption of dead land and the unsettled reply of dissimilar soils-perhaps a sign of the unreliable answer of men to the divine message-has been indistinct by inserted sentences into explanation of the revival; the insertions are noticeable by a abrupt alteration of pronoun from 'he' to 'we', referring to God

Answer:

It is said that verse 57-58 of surah Al-Aaraf do not have the relevance to its context and according to grammar each of them should be divided into two parts. This objection does not have any academic base because this is a well-known fact that the development of

³⁷Islahi, *Tadabural Qur `ān*. Vol 3.182-184.

languages is not dependent to its grammar because grammar of any language developed according to the language. That is why there is no hundred percent perfect rule regarding grammar. There are certain exceptions regarding grammar because it is developed on the grounds that how people use to talk and write, it is not so that first the rules of grammar have been designed and people will directed to write and speak according to that.³⁸ If there would be any contradiction of grammar used in the Arab society; It was firstly objected by the Arab people themselves that the language of Qur'an is not standardized. Basically grammar is usually designed for the foreigners so that they can better understand a language and can avoid errors. It is not right to make objection on the grammar of native people.

2.7 At-Tawba: (40)

] إِلَّا تَنْصُرُوهُ فَقَدْ نَصَرَهُ اللَّهُ إِذْ أَخْرَجَهُ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا ثَانِيَ اثْنَيْنِ إِذْ هُمَا فِي الْغَارِ إِذْ يَقُولُ لِصَاحِبِهِ لَا تَحْزَنْ إِنَّ اللَّهَ مَعَنَا فَأَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ سَكِينَتَهُ عَلَيْهِ وَأَيَّدَهُ بِجُنُودٍ لَمْ تَرَوْ هَا وَجَعَلَ كَلِمَةَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا السُّفْلَى وَكَلِمَةُ اللَّهِ هِيَ الْعُلْيَا وَاللَّهُ عَزِيزٌ حَكِيمً

[If ye help him not, still Allah helped him when those who disbelieve drove him forth, the second of two; when they two were in the cave, when he said unto his comrade: Grieve not. Lo! Allah is with us. Then Allah caused His peace of reassurance to descend upon him and supported him with hosts ye cannot see, and made the word of those who disbelieved the nethermost, while Allah's Word it was that became the uppermost. Allah is Mighty, Wise. (40)]

Objection:

It is said that verse 40 of the surah Tawba stands lonely, though it evidently requires something in front of it. In the context there is no mention of Prophet (PBUH) towards which the pronoun 'him' is referring, but verse 128 talks about the Prophet (PBUH), Verse 40 and 128 together give a stirring call for the devotion to the Prophet (PBUH). This shows that this verse was cut into two parts, one part was added to 127 and second part located after 39. The explanation about [أَنْاَنِي َاأَنْتَيْنَ] is also dependents on guesses. Muslim scholars referee this tradition towards Abu Bakar just to raise his status.

Answer:

The above mention obligation is itself contradictory if verse 128 was missing and verse 40 was its part so it should also be missed on the very same time. If it was not missing than this hypothesis is wrong. Verse 40 is completely connected with former verses. In this passage the believers were tempted for the holy wars. This incident was of Tabbok , it was very difficult time because of harsh weather, famine and starvation. People were escaping to take part in this holy war. At this very time by making it compulsory to take part in the

³⁸Islahi, *Tadabural Qur 'ān*. Vol 3.182-184.

holy war and by referring towards their reluctant behaviors two important things have been pointed out.³⁹

One is this that if those people will not leave for holy war; Allah has decided to lift up his religion so He will fetch those people who will be ready for any sort of sacrifice.

Secondly giving example form the history it was guarantee that Allah's support will remain to the Prophet (PBUH) whatever the hardships and difficulties were produced. Allah SWT has narrated examples from the Prophet (PBUH) 's life that people were at time was ready to kill him and they fix the ransom for his murder and when Prophet (PBUH) was sleeping in the cave and they were so near to him that if they looked down towards their feet they could saw the Prophet (PBUH).But Allah SWT protected him from every evil and Prophet (PBUH) was save and sound.⁴⁰It is to convey through this verse that if you will not fulfil the requirements and the demands mentioned in the verse 38-39,Allāh will not depart his Prophet (PBUH) helpless,⁴¹ so it is not right to say that this verse is irrelevant.

The second hypothesis about نَّانِى ٱنْتَيْنَى there are guesses in this tradition, if this hypothesis is taken as right than the trust will be broken from the history of humanity. Because history is agreed upon this fact that in this occasion only Abu Bakar was with Prophet (PBUH). Even those Shia scholars who did not accept the superiority of Abu Bakar they also consider Abu Bakar as تَثَانِى ٱنْتَانِى ٱلْتَانِي

2.8 At-Tawba:127-128

] وَإِذَا مَا أُنْزِلَتْ سُورَةٌ نَظَرَ بَعْضُهُمْ إِلَى بَعْضٍ هَلْ يَرَاكُمْ مِنْ أَحَدٍ ثُمَّ انْصَرَفُوا صَرَفَ اللَّهُ قُلُوبَهُمْ بِأَنَّهُمْ قَوْمٌ لَا يَفْقَهُونَ (127) لَقَدْ جَاءَكُمْ رَسُولٌ مِنْ أَنْفُسِكُمْ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَاعَنِتُمْ حَرِيصٌ عَلَيْكُمْ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ (128) فَإِنْ تَوَلَّوْا فَقُلْ حَسْبِيَ اللَّهُ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَا هُوَ عَلَيْهِ تَوَكَّلْتُ وَهُوَ رَبُّ الْعَرْشِ الْعَظِيمِ [

] And whenever a surah is revealed, they look one at another (as who should say): Doth anybody see you? Then they turn away. Allah turned away their hearts because they are a folk who understand not. (127) There hath come unto you a messenger, (one) of yourselves, unto whom aught that ye are overburdened is grievous, full of concern for you, for the believers full of pity, merciful. (128)]

Objection:

It is said that the last two verses of this surah to have come to the information of Zaid thabit ibn-Tabit when he had almost finished his duty of compiling the Qur'an, and he has sited here as the most suitable place at the time. Watt also asserted the point that there is a split in the union between the verse 127,128 and 129. These two verses are situated secluded.

³⁹Isalhi, *Tadubural Quran*. Vol 3,376-377.

⁴⁰ Ali, *Jawahirul Qur `ān*.Vol 1,438.

⁴¹Qandalvi,*Ma'ariful Qur'ān* .Vol 3.436-448.

⁴² Maudidi.*Tafheem -ul- Qur `ān*.Vol 2.195-196.

But there seems a strong connection between 127 and 129. This is an example to prove that there was some modification and addition in some of the passages it may happened that the back of verse 128 was use to carve on it.

Answer;

We have discussed this issue in the first chapter.⁴³

2.9 Al Hajj: (5-8)

] يَاأَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ فِي رَيْبٍ مِنَ الْبَعْثِ فَإِنَّا خَلَقْنَاكُمْ مِنْ تُرَابٍ ثُمَّ مِنْ نُطْفَةٍ ثُمَّ مِنْ عَلَقَةٍ تُمَّ مِنْ عَنَّهُ عَنَى مَعْنَةٍ وَعَيْر مُخَلَقَة لِنُبَيِّنَ لَكُمْ وَنُقِرُ فِي الْأَرْحَامِ مَا نَشَاءُ إِلَى أَجَلٍ مُسَمَّى ثُمَّ نُخْرِ جُكُمْ طِفْلًا ثُمَّ لِنَبَّلْغُوا أَشُدَكُمْ مَنْ يُتَوَفًى وَمِنْكُمْ مَنْ يُرَدُ إِلَى أَرْذَلِ الْعُمُرِ لِكَيْلَا يَعْلَمَ مِنْ بَعْدِ عِلْمٍ شَيْئًا وَتَرَى الْأَرْضَ هَامِدَةَ فَإِذ يُرَدُ إِلَى أَرْذَلِ الْعُمُرِ لِكَيْلَا يَعْلَمَ مِنْ بَعْدِ عِلْمٍ شَيْئًا وَتَرَى الْأَرْضَ هَامِدَةَ فَإِذَا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَيْهَا الْمَاءَ اهْتَزَتْ وَرَبَتْ وَأَنْبَتَتْ مِنْ يُرَدُ إِلَى أَرْذَلِ الْعُمُرِ لِكَيْلَا يَعْلَمَ مِنْ بَعْدِ عِلْمٍ شَيْئًا وَتَرَى الْأَرْضَ هَامِدَةَ فَإِذَا يُرَدُونُ مَنَا مَنْ يَقَالَمُ مَنْ يَعْذَمُ مِنْ يَعْذِ عِلْمَ أَمَنْ يَعْدِ عَلْمُ أَنْ اللَّوْتَى وَأَنَّهُ عَلَى أَرْذَلِ الْعُمُرِ الْمَاءَ مِنْ يَعْذِ عَلْمَ مِنْ يَعْذِي وَأَنَّهُ عَلَى كُلُو مُنَ

] O mankind! if ye are in doubt concerning the Resurrection, then lo! We have created you from dust, then from a drop of seed, then from a clot, then from a little lump of flesh shapely and shapeless, that We may make (it) clear for you. And We cause what We will to remain in the wombs for an appointed time, and afterward We bring you forth as infants, then (give you growth) that ye attain your full strength. And among you there is he who diet (young), and among you there is he who is brought back to the most abject time of life, so that, after knowledge, he knows the naught. And thou (Muhammad) sees the earth barren, but when We send down water thereon, it doth thrill and swell and put forth every lovely kind (of growth). (5) That is because Allah, He is the Truth and Lo! He quickened the dead, and Lo! He is Able to do all things; (6) And because the Hour will come, there is no doubt thereof; and because Allah will raise those who are in the graves. (7) And among mankind is he who disputed concerning Allah without knowledge or guidance or a scripture giving light, (8)]

Objection:

In the verse 5 to 8 of surah Hajj there is the great difference of tone and approach this reflects that these verses did not belong to the original context. These verses talk about the rebirth and demonstrate the power of God , and ends with the describing the people who fights without having knowledge, direction or a book having enlightenment. Two

⁴³For explanation of the same verse see *Tadaburul Quran* vol 3,664-665. Ali,*Jawahirul Quran*.vol 1, 459.

Qaadri, The Holy Quran. Translation of Kinzul Eman. 266-267.

Maududi, Tafheem-ul-Quran.vol 2.254-255.

Qandalvi, Ma'ariful Quran, Vol 3, 42-545

opposite themes are discussed in these verses it seems that these verses are inelegantly joined.

Answer:

Surah Hajj started with the description about day of judgment according to the details mentioned in Qur'an this universal distraction is the beginning of a new life. Qur'an has clash with the disbelievers on these concepts one is about day of judgment and the second is about life after death. Because if we believe the life after death then automatically there comes a need to be ready for it or to be successful in it.⁴⁴To believe in God, divine guidance and prophets all are associated with it .If there would be no any concept of life after death there would be no need for such like things. In the verse 5-8, logic of life after death has been given that human beings are created from clay and they while suffering from different stages met with the same soil. Just like the same thing the part of soil which was not used in the creation of human beings when it rains it met with its life. And with the passage of time when this soil met with the autumn it once again become the part of soil,⁴⁵this is our daily observation. There shouldn't be any hesitation to accept the reality that the part of soil which was being use in the creation of the human being will surely be take its rebirth.⁴⁶These verses are not irrelevant rather they are logical for the former verses and an introduction to the upcoming verses.

2.10 Az-zumar: (75)

] وَتَرَى الْمَلَائِكَةَ حَافِينَ مِنْ حَوْلِ الْعَرْشِ يُسَبِّحُونَ بِحَمْدِ رَبِّهِمْ وَقُضِيَ بَيْنَهُمْ بِالْحَقِّ وَقِيلَ الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ [

[And thou (O Muhammad) sees the angels thronging round the Throne, hymning the praises of their Lord. And they are judged aright. And it is said: Praise be to Allah, the Lord of the Worlds! (75)]

Objection:

Verse 75 of sura Zumar also looks lonely. The verse is describing the scene of judgment but all about the judgement have been done and all the details were over but suddenly the description of judgement starts again where the judgement will be given with legitimacy. The same thing has been mentioned in the verse 69 this shows the real position of the verse 75. The description has been completed till the verse 69 but at later stages it was dislocated with much longer. This phrase, which has already occurred in verse 69, indicates what was the original position of verse 75; it followed the first phrase of 69 and completed the scene; at some later stage it was displace by the much longer depiction in verses 69-74.

Answer;

⁴⁴ Hafiz Amadud din Ibn Kathir. *Tafseer ibn* Kathir. Translated by Peer Karam Shah Al Azrhi. Vol 04. Zia ul Qur'ān Publication: Lahore. 2004.

⁴⁵Islahi, *Tadaburul Qur `ān*. Vol 5,216-219.

⁴⁶Mududi, *Tafheem ul Qur `ān*. Vol 3,202-205.

At the end of surah Az-zumar the complete picture of day of Resurrection has been depicted that how He passes judgement on the people of Paradise and Hell. In which it is told when the Trumpet will be blown for the second time all people will stands up. All the land will Enlighted with the light of Allah SWT and judgment will start. First of all the book of deeds will be handed over to people then prophets were called and they will testify that they had deliver Allah's message to their nations,⁴⁷ then other witness will come. Everybody will be rewarded according to their deeds and people according to their deeds will go to Paradise or Hell. In the last two verses the last scene of day of judgement has narrated that people going to paradise will praise the greatness of Allah SWT and they will be very thankful for Him.⁴⁸ The very last verse to whom Watt has a point of view that it should be after verse 69 is depicting about the last scene of day of judgement when all of the deskins have been taken the angels will surround the Majestic Throne and they will admire the greatness of Allah SWT.49 This all scene will end on the pronouncement of the sequence of these verses is quite clear, it is not appropriate to say that verse الله رَبِّ ٱلْعَلَمِين 75 should come after verse 69. Because verse 69 is portraying the picture of the early scene of day of judgement while verse 75 is depiction the last scene of judgement.⁵⁰

2.11 Al-Muddaththir: (31)

] وَمَا جَعَلْنَا أَصْحَابَ النَّارِ إِلَّا مَلَائِكَةً وَمَا جَعَلْنَا عِدَّتَهُمْ إِلَّا فِتْنَةً لِلَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لِيَسْتَيْقِنَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْكِتَابَ وَيَزْدَادَ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِيمَانًا وَلَا يَرْتَابَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْكِتَابَ وَالْمُؤْمِنُونَ وَلِيَقُولَ الَّذِينَ فِي قُلُوبِهِمْ مَرَضٌ وَالْكَافِرُونَ مَاذَا أَرَادَ اللَّهُ بِهَذَا مَثَلًا كَذَلِكَ يُضِلُّ اللَّهُ مَنْ يَسْاءُ وَيَهْدِي مَنْ يَسْاءُ وَمَا يَعْلَمُ جُنُونَ وَلِيَقُولَ الَّذِينَ فِي قُ

] We have appointed only angels to be wardens of the Fire, and their number have We made to be a stumbling-block for those who disbelieve; that those to whom the Scripture hath been given may have certainty, and that believers may increase in faith; and that those to whom the Scripture hath been given and believers may not doubt; and that those in whose hearts there is disease, and disbelievers, may say: What meant Allah by this similitude? Thus Allah sended astray whom He will, and whom He Will He guides. None knows the hosts of thy Lord save Him. This is naught else than a Reminder unto mortals. (31)]

Objection:

In surah Al-Muddaththir the verse number 31 is evidently look like an addition by the dissimilar approach and length of verse. These sort of additions maybe possibly by a collector or reader later on.

Answer:

⁴⁷Mududi, *Tafheem ul Qur `ān*. Vol 4,385.

⁴⁸Ali, *Jawahirul Qur `ān*. Vol 3, 1039.

⁴⁹Islahi,Tadaburul Qur[°]ān.Vol 6,616.

⁵⁰*Tafseer-i-Kamalyn* by Jalaludin Mahalli.vol 5,387-396.

Verse 75 is definitely longer than rest of the verses. Qur'an asserted this point so many times that this is not a book of poetry that it should have verses of same length. And in the free verse there is margin that the length of the sentences may differ. As far as its sequences is concerned this verse begins with the description of people of fire, and the former verse also portrait the Hell.⁵¹In this very verse the reference from the former verses is also mentioned that there are nineteen angels who are appointed on Hell and in this verse it is said their strength is a dilemma(azmaiesh) for disbelievers and Muslim believe on it.⁵²The verse ends with the same frame work in which the former verses⁵³[$\tilde{(\pi)}$]etc. So this is not appropriate to say that this passage is inserted by later collector.

2.12 Al-Qiyamma: (16-19)

] لا تُحَرِّكْ بِهِ لِسَانَكَ لِتَعْجَلَ بِهِ (16) إِنَّ عَلَيْنَا جَمْعَهُ وَقُرْ آنَهُ (17) فَإِذَا قَرَ أُنَاهُ فَاتَّبِعْ قُرْ آنَهُ (18) ثُمَّ إِنَّ عَلَيْنَا بَيَانَهُ [

] Stir not thy tongue herewith to hasten it. (16) Lo! upon Us (rested) the putting together thereof and the reading thereof. (17) And when We read it, follow thou the reading; (18) Then lo! upon Us (rested) the explanation thereof. (19)]

Objection:

The Watt had created disagreement about the verses 17-20 of surah Al Qi Yama that the following verses do not has any relation to the previous or subsequent verses. The following verses do not have any thematic connection here or the rhyme of this phrase is also diverse. It is very complicated to find out the reason why this passage has been inserted here it might be supposing that any collector put these verses here but on the very same time it seems that this is a silly mistake commit by a collector and according to Bell's assumption it was happened because theses verses were written at the back of verse 13-16.

Something similar is true of 75.16-19. Verses 13-16 (partly renowned by poetry, partially by extent) seem to have been added to 7-12, which pact with the Last Day, and to have been written on the back of the early 'scrap' contains 16-19.

Answer:

The background and reason of this revelation of this verse has been mention in the Hadīth and commentaries. Mulana Mudded narrated the coherence of these verses according to its context that if we ponder upon these verses in the background of this incident than we cannot say that these verses are disjoined. We can understand this through an example of a teacher who during his lecture observes that a student is diverting and paying his attention to somewhere else. So the teacher at that point stop his lecture and drive his attention by

⁵¹ Al Maraghi, *Tafseer al Maraghi*. Vol 10.253-256.

⁵²Mududi, *Tafheemul Qur `ān* . Vol 8,152-153.

⁵³Islahi, *Tadaburul Qur `ān*. Vol 9,55-60.

saying listen to me and restart his lecture. This narration is quoted in Bukhari, Muslim, Masnad Ahmad, Tirmidi, Nisaie, mTibri and other scholars mentioned it as well. While explaining the coherence Mulana Tanvi wrote, that in the former verses it is told that in the day of judgement the book of deeds will be presented before every body and they will recall all of their deeds this is not at all difficult for Allah SWT. So this is not difficult too that Allah will save the revelation in the memory of prophet and will proclaim his answer. So the former verses are presented as evidence.⁵⁴

Anwar Shah Kashmiri writes, in Qur'an the references the Quran's protection and truthfulness comes in many verses with the references of context. This commonly happened with the discussion of day of resurrection (Maryam 64:19, Taha 113:20,Al-Qiyama 16-19,Sad 67:38,Yaseen 36 69-70).The discussion of Qur'an accrue during the matter of unseen. Anwar Shah Kashmiri writes about the revelation of Qur'an that in so many verses in a very strange way, sometimes it is not that obvious, nor people can properly define it. But mostly during the discussion of unseen there is the declaration of Qur'an being revealed from God. Although there is no mentioned in words but by the way there is a declaration which claim the protection of the Qur'an.⁵⁵The real objective of this surah are revolving around theses verses the context is defining this objective. Quran is not being written in form of a book rather it is a sort of a speech because the real motive of Qur'an is to purify the heart and soul not just to hand over a book to people. That is why we observe repetition in so many places. There are very few examples that a complete topic is discussed in a place. Mostly a topic is discussed in more than one places. Some time it is discussed in a detail and sometime a very brief summary will be given.

Moreover, it is seen that does not use the technical language of that particular subject like social issues, scientific discoveries, simple facts, the problems of fight, rather it adds some verses, sentences and passages.

In surah Al Qi Yama, the development of f finger prints has been mentioned to illustrate the fact that how the record of unchangeable have been kept saved. This is the logic in which the details of law of reward and punishment of human deeds has been discussed. So these verses are highly connected to their context.⁵⁶

In surah Al Ala[أَسْتُقُونُكُ فَلَاتَنَسَى]a is used in the same context. To the real purpose of surah is to tell Prophet (PBUH) that the it is not his duty or responsibility to learn and memorize the Qur'an rather it is Divine obligation to make you memorize or abrogate any of the verse. The former and the foremost verse are use as the evidence to elaborate this objective.⁵⁷

2.13 An-Naba: (33-34)

⁵⁴Mariful Qur 'ān.620;VOL 8

⁵⁵Anwar Shah Kashmiri, *Mushkala-tul-Qur `ān*. (Idara Talefat-i- Asrafia: Multan) 206.

⁵⁶ Ibid.,275.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

]وَكَوَاعِبَ أَثْرَابًا (٣٣) وَكَأْسَأَدِهَاقًا [

[And maidens of companions; (33) And a full cup. (34)]

]حَدَابِقَ وَأَعْنَلْبا (٣٢) لَّايَسْمَعُونَ فِيهَالَغُوُّاوَ لَاكِذَابُا [

[Gardens enclosed and vineyards, (32) There hear they never vain discourse, nor lying - (35)]

Objection:

Verses 33 and 34 of surah An Naba breaks the link between verses 32 and 35.

Answer:

Verse 35 is directly related to verse 34 in which the drink of Paradise has mentioned.⁵⁸People lost their senses after drinking, they start abusing and lying. So it is said in 35 that the vine of Paradise will not affect like this.[وَكُوَاعِبَ أَثَرَ البُّا]is also not out of context because whatever bounties of Paradise has mentioned if there will be no maiden available, the Paradise turns to a very boarding place.⁵⁹

2.14 Abasa: (34-37)

] يَوْمَ يَفِرُ الْمَرْءُ مِنْ أَخِيهِ (34) وَأُمِّهِ وَأَبِيهِ (35) وَصَاحِبَتِهِ وَبَنِيهِ (36) لِكُلِّ امْرِئٍ مِنْهُمْ يَوْمَئِذٍ شَأْنٌ يُغْنِيهِ [

[On the day when a man fleet from his brother (34) And his mother and his father (35) And his wife and his children, (36) Every man that day will have concern enough to make him heedless (of others). (37)]

Objection:

In surah Abasa 34-37 have different rhyme scheme from whole of the surah while verse 33 to 38 and till the end of the surah have the same rhyme. This shows that alteration has been made with in the surah.

Answer:

Regarding verses 34-37 it is objected that their rhymes are different from the context. This objection is not at all valid because it is very common in the world of literature that different stanzas of a poem are some times of different rhyme and it is accepted in the world of literature. It is never objected in English poetry that why a rhyme of particular stanza is different to other. In Urdu and Persian poetry three lines, four lines, five lines, six lines and eight lines stanza are very common and important. In Spain this form of writing is known as Muwashahaat. We often observe this kind of writing in Qur'an and it was never be objected.⁶⁰

⁵⁸ Ibn Kathir. *Tafseer ibn Kathir*. Vol 04,801-802.

⁵⁹ Al Maraghi, Tafsīr*Al Maraghi*. Vol 10.310-313.

⁶⁰ Al Maraghi, *Tafseer al Maraghi*. Vol 10,335-337.

2.15 Al-Inshiqaq: (16-17)

] إِنَّهُ كَانَ فِي أَهْلِهِ مَسْرُورًا (13) إِنَّهُ ظَنَّ أَنْ لَنْ يَحُورَ (14) بَلَى إِنَّ رَبَّهُ كَانَ بِهِ بَصِيرًا (15) فَلَا أُقْسِمُ بِالشَّفَقِ[

]He verily lived joyous with his folk, (13) He verily deemed that he would never return (unto Allah). (14) Nay, but lo! his Lord is ever looking on him! (15) Oh, I swear by the afterglow of sunset, (16)]

Objection:

In sura Inshiqaq there is no sudden modification of rhyme, but verses 13-15 obliterate the stability of the previous section. It seems that it was added later and the added verses take the same place. A very easy justification of the arrangement of the unrelated verses would be that it was written on the back of the paper on which the added verses were later written

Answer:

Verse 13-15 of sura Inshiqaq is not irrelevant because verses 13-15 are defining the reason of the consequence which is mentioned in the verses 10-12.⁶¹

2.16 Al-Ala: (16-19)

[But ye prefer the life of the world (16) Although the Hereafter is better and more lasting. (17) Lo! This is in the former scrolls. (18) The Books of Abraham and Moses. (19)]

Objection;

In surah Al-Ala an abrupt alteration in the the position at verse 16 shows that this is added later on.

Answer;

The last four verses of surah Al-Ala are describing the opposite situation of verse 14-15 that successful are those people who spend a pious life, remember their Lord and offer their prayers.⁶²People give preference to this mortal world and overlook the day of judgment.⁶³ These verses are on a sequences and this is very strange to say that there is dramatic change.

⁶¹Islahi, *Tadaburi Qur `ān*.vol 9,277. For more explanation of the verse see

Qandalvi, Ma'ariful Qur'ān .Vol 8,413.

Ali, Jawahirul Qur'ān .Vol 3.1357.

Maududi, Tafheem ul Qur'ān .Vol 8,391.

⁶² Al Maraghi, *Tafseer al Maraghi*. Vol 10,400-402.

⁶³Islahi, *Tadaburi Qur `ān*. Vol 9,320-321.

2.17 Al-Ghashia: (6-7)

] لَيْسَ لَهُمْ طَعَامٌ إِلَّا مِنْ ضَرِيعِ (6) لَا يُسْمِنُ وَلَا يُغْنِي مِنْ جُوعِ [

[No food for them save bitter thorn-fruit (6) Which doth not nourish nor release from hunger.]

Objection:

The different rhyme of Verses 6 and 7 indicates that these verses are incorporated later.

2.18 Al-Ghashia: (17-20)

[Will they not regard the camels, how they are created? (17) And the heaven, how it is raised? (18) And the hills, how they are set up? (19) And the earth, how it is spread? (20)]

Objection:

The particular surah starts with the account of the resurrection and the destiny of the sinful also describe the features of virtuous. There is break in the theme, rhyme and the tone of the surah from verse 17 to 20 in which the subject matter also changed from the earlier and the preceding verses.

Answer:

Verse 6-7 has different rhyme but they are in a sequence and completing the former verse. As for as the rhyme of the verses of Qur'an concerned, it is not a form of poetry in which rhyme should be same. In this very surah from verse 17-26 this passage is further divided into four different portions according to their rhyme. The very simple reason is this that in different languages, in poetry and prose it is very common that their rhyme changed which we have already discussed in detail. Their examples are stanzas in English literature and Muwashahat in Arabic literature. The second objection about this passage is that the first portion of this passage is describing the day of judgement but this portion is driving our attention towards the different natural cryptogram. It is because the success of hereafter depends on Belief,⁶⁴ and to propagate about this belief Allah SWT not only send his messengers but on the very same time each and every aspect of the nature is announcing that a great creator has created them for example camel was very known animal in Arabia if we ponder upon its creation and advantages we come to know that in deserts where the journey is usually very long and there are shortage of water on the very same time, Allah SWT has created such an animal which can move on the same speed even without taking water for five days.⁶⁵Just like the same the mountains, sky and earth are the evidence of Allah SWT's presence. After pointing out towards these natural signs,

⁶⁴Islahi, *Tadabural Qur `ān*. Vol 9,333.

⁶⁵Mududi, *Tafheem ul Qur `ān*. Vol 8.321-322.

at the end of surah return towards the first message that Prophet (PBUH)'s duty is only to convey the message.⁶⁶Their judgement is Allah SWT's duty if they accepted the right path they will be rewarded or if they denied the right path and ignored Allah SWT's guidance they will be punished.⁶⁷

2-Conclusion:

The research concludes that the processes of collection and compilation of Qur'an was highly systematic and was done under the supervision of Prophet (PBUH). There was a number of people who were not only responsible to preserve the Qur'an in written form but on the very same time a lot of people learnt it by heart. According to the definition of Qur'an it was transmitted by a big majority without any doubt and it is humanly impossible that such a big majority can unified on lie.

As far as the literary style of Qur'an is concerned it is by no means an easy book to understand. It is neither a treatise on theology, nor a code of laws, nor a collection of sermons, but rather a medley of all three, with other things thrown in. As it reflects the changing circumstances, needs and purposes of the Muslims during those years, it naturally varies much in style and content, and even in teaching. The Arabic in which it is written is, on the whole, intelligible; there are difficult passages whose meaning, as the Arabs say, is known to God alone. So to compare such like piece of writing with the present day ordinary books and point out its suppose literary defects is quiet a nonacademic approach.

3-Recommendations:

It is recommended that in the text books of our school and colleges it should be taught that the processes of collection and compilation was greatly systematic and transparent. The transmission of the Qur'an was not depending only on few people so we should condemn the spread of such like traditions which harm the authenticity of the Qur'an.

It is also recommended that the Muslim scholars should try to create the atmosphere in which students are encouraged to write critical analysis of the books by the orientalists.

There is a need to reconcile the material which is mentioned in the books of Hadith and there should be a forum in which the authenticity of the traditions should be checked out which are providing a help to such like people to raise objections.

⁶⁶ Al-Hilali, Muhammad Taqi-ud-din and Muhammad Moshin Khan. *Tafseer-i-Maeani Al Quran-ul-Kareem*. 769.

⁶⁷ Saeedi. *Tibyanul Quran*.vol 12 710-711.